

# APPENDIX A

## Risks and Benefits Analysis

|                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|--------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                    | Carry out a public consultation exercise considering the creation of a new CFA consisting of the Authorities of Hampshire, Portsmouth, Southampton and the Isle of Wight.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Maintain existing arrangements                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                    | <b>Benefits:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <b>Risks:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <b>Benefits:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>Risks:</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>Operational</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A new CFA could provide an enhanced resilience and capacity facility for operational employees.</li> <li>• Both Hampshire and Isle of Wight employees currently enjoy the benefits of shared operational learning and knowledge. It is felt that a new CFA could ensure that the sharing of operational learning and knowledge continues.</li> <li>• The Strategic Partnership between the HFRA and the IWC has been successfully operating for three years and has delivered benefits to both Authorities. The creation of a new CFA could build on the operational benefits realised under the existing partnership.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The creation of a new CFA could pose challenges with regards to geography. The ability to travel from one location to another, especially in an emergency situation is more difficult. Ensuring the most efficient mode of transport is always available will be extremely important for the success of a new CFA.</li> <li>• Each Authority currently has different Integrated Risk Management Plans (IRMP). There are also different priorities, response standards and performance indicators. Ideally these would be aligned but this would take some time to work through and there would be a period where two Authorities would remain separate and still have separate plans</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Remaining as two separate organisations would maintain each organisation's focus in the short term. There would be no distractions from a change in governance.</li> <li>• If organisations were to remain as two separate entities, each organisation could maintain their own independence</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creating a new CFA would create capacity and resilience, if the status quo remained there could not be the opportunity to increase capacity and resilience.</li> <li>• Existing relationships do not continue to develop.</li> </ul> |

|                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p><b>Organisational (people)</b></p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Good relationships between the two Authorities already exist and continue to thrive. The creation of a new CFA could provide a more stable platform to ensure the continued success of relationships.</li> <li>• There are currently two separate teams whose role is to provide internal and external communications. The creation of a new CFA could ensure consistent internal and external messaging and could result in one single Communications Strategy.</li> <li>• Both Authorities have their own individual strengths which could be combined into a new CFA to improve reputation and profile locally and nationally.</li> <li>• A new CFA could provide the opportunity for an increased and shared organisational resilience and capacity.</li> <li>• The Strategic Partnership between the HFRA and the IWC has been successfully operating for three years and has delivered benefits to both Authorities. A new CFA could provide the opportunity for increased and shared organisational learning and knowledge.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The new CFA would inherit a property portfolio that has a number of liabilities. Increased resource may be needed from a Health and Safety and Estates perspective in the short term.</li> <li>• Each Authority is currently very different in its culture and identity. How the two organisations could be brought together ensuring staff from both Hampshire and the Isle of Wight are valued equally will take some time to work through. Learning can be sought from Devon &amp; Somerset and Dorset and Wiltshire Fire and Rescue Services who have recently undergone a combination.</li> <li>• The creation of a new CFA will result in an initial short-term increase in workloads as part of the implementation and move to business as usual. Teams have recently undergone a review to ensure they are working in the most efficient way financially and any extra work placed on them may need to be financed and resourced separately (in the short term) or will require a</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could mean that the IWFRS property estate would not be transferred to the new CFA and property liabilities would not be transferred.</li> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could result in no requirement to join existing teams and go through a process to achieve one organisation.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could have a negative effect on the progress of the current partnership</li> <li>• If the existing arrangements were maintained both organisations could not be able to realise the benefits of becoming a new CFA. Separate strategies would still remain and duplication of work could continue to exist.</li> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations and the subsequent review of DDiP, may not continue on the same trajectory as previous progress has demonstrated.</li> </ul> |
|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|
|  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The creation of a new CFA could acknowledge the importance both Authorities place on collaboration and partnership working and assist with meeting the duties set out in the Policing and Crime Act 2017.</li> <li>• A larger organisation could provide greater learning and development opportunities for staff assisting with retention rates and high performance.</li> <li>• Opportunities for staff to work flexibility across the Isle of Wight and Hampshire.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>re-prioritisation of existing workloads.</li> <li>• Some areas of work carried out by the Authorities are complex and further investigation needs to be carried out to better understand how easy it will be to align them. The final alignment of teams may take some time if complex issues are uncovered such as aligning IT networks and re-negotiation of contracts.</li> <li>• Both Authorities currently have a number of contracts, partnerships, Service Level Agreements (SLAs) and Memorandum of Understandings (MOUs), some of which may have financial aspects, and it could take some time to unpick these for a new CFA. There could also be a potential cost and resource implications for the re-write, negotiation, exiting or entering of contracts.</li> <li>• The creation of a new CFA will require a considerable amount of implementation which could result in the disruption of business as usual work. Ensuring that an</li> </ul> |  |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|

|                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <p>implementation team is resourced appropriately and can support current teams would help to eliminate any disruption.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current IT networks are different across HFRA and IWC. The cost of aligning networks and ensuring a full IT functionality are unknown and further investigation will be required to identify the full cost.</li> <li>• The council could not have direct control of fire resources.</li> </ul> |                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Public Safety</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The creation of a new CFA and the bringing together of teams and strategies could allow for the alignment of Communications Strategies. This could ensure a wider reach of safety campaigns and greater consistency of safety messages to the public.</li> <li>• A new larger CFA would allow for greater opportunity for enhanced cutting-edge delivery of services to communities and businesses across the whole of Hampshire and the Isle of Wight.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current safety messages are relayed to the public in an inconsistent manner due an unaligned Communications Strategy. The public should receive safety messages in the most clear and effective way rather than in the current ad hoc way.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                      | <p>We have not identified any benefits to public safety should the status quo remain.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could mean that the public won't receive all the potential benefits identified in the creation of a new CFA.</li> </ul> |

|                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Strategic Partnership currently in place has resulted in benefits to the communities in Hampshire and the Isle of Wight. The creation of a new CFA could further enhance these benefits and lead to safer communities.</li> <li>• HFRS and IWFRS have already establish arrangements for a shared fire control.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>Financial</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A new CFA with a larger budget could provide additional financial resilience and capacity.</li> <li>• The current Emergency Services Mobile Communications Programme (ESMCP) national project will require individual Authorities to invest financially in new technological equipment to support the national infrastructure put in place. A new CFA could mean one single investment as opposed to two separate ones.</li> <li>• It is anticipated that there could be efficiency savings available in the long term for the new CFA.</li> <li>• Potential savings to IWC could be made – saving of overheads</li> <li>• Additional council tax income will be realised through harmonisation and be available to support borrowing to invest in the fire and rescue service.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The total cost of implementation is not known. The full cost of implementation will be investigated and clarified should the full business case be progressed.</li> <li>• There is a property maintenance liability of approximately £3 million when the assets transfer into a new CFA. This may require some short and medium-term investment.</li> <li>• Ability to make savings in the future are more constrained.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations would mean there could not be any incurrence of costs as there would be to implement the changes in governance and create a new CFA.</li> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations means there could be no transfer of property liability.</li> <li>• If the IWFRS remains integrated within the IWC, it could mean that the Council's overall budget would not decrease.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There would be limited capacity for the IWFRS to make further efficiency savings without compromising the delivery of the service.</li> </ul> |

|                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p><b>Legal</b></p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Theresa May launched the Fire Reform agenda in May 2016 which focused on improved efficiency, effectiveness and public safety for Fire Authorities. The creation of a new CFA to ensure greater efficiency, effectiveness and public safety supports Home Office policy and the direction they expect with regards to collaboration.</li> <li>• A new CFA could assist with partnership working in that it would make the boundary co-terminous with Hampshire Constabulary.</li> <li>• The PCC has set his expectation in his letter to the IWC Leader. The creation of a new CFA would demonstrate that both Authorities are aligned with the PCCs views and current thinking.</li> </ul> |  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could mean that the IWC could retain political control and accountability of the Fire and Rescue Service (FRS).</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maintaining as two separate organisations could not meet the 'successful coming together' that the PCC describes in the letter to IWC Leader dated 12 February 2018 and may result in a business case submitted by the PCC to look at future governance models.</li> </ul> |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|