APPENDIX 2

Appendix 2 – West Wight School Place Planning Update January 2020

Objections to Public Notice – Comments Received

Comment received within objection to Public Notice	Officer Response
Federate or amalgamate All Saints' CE Primary with Yarmouth CE Primary School keeping both sites open (5).	It is not possible to amalgamate these two schools; this scenario would still require one of the schools to be closed. Federation would create a three-school federation which from an education perspective does not offer the best outcomes for children. Where it has been tried it has been shown that the challenges it brings out-weigh the benefits it might achieve. Keeping both sites open would not resolve the fact that too many schools with too much accommodation exist on the West Wight. It would also create a financial situation that would put all schools in the West Wight at risk.
Federate All Saints' CE Primary with Brighstone Primary (2).	This does not address the over-supply of school accommodation in the West Wight. The distance between the two sites would make management and leadership complex and offer no guarantee of success. As with other options put forward it would also create a financial fragility for all the schools across the area.
Close Shalfleet CE Primary rather than All Saints' in order to manage surplus places (4).	This option has not been tabled within any consultation to date. Closing Shalfleet would break the Yarmouth, Shalfleet federation which has proven successful. Shalfleet serves a distinct set of rural communities, has seen significant capital investment of £1.6 million over the past few years, and could expand in the future if required. It would also leave two small schools in the West Wight that would be vulnerable financially as pupil numbers fall over the coming years.
All Saints' CE Primary has recently received 'Good' in Ofsted inspection (Sept 2019) so no longer poorly performing school (4).	The recent Ofsted rating does show All Saints' to be improving both in terms of standards and leadership.
Yarmouth has not had an Ofsted Inspection since 2013 but All Saints' rating of Good is from September 2019.	Schools are inspected by Ofsted and the council plays no part in the timing of those inspections.
All Saints' CE Primary School achieved one of highest SATs results on Island in summer 2019 proving it provides good educational outcomes (3).	All Saints' did achieve one of highest SATs results on Island in summer 2019 and that achievement has been recognised. In looking at this it must also be taken in to account the level of educational and

	leadership support the school has received
	from the council over the past few years.
Yarmouth CE Primary leadership and local community are not supportive of the proposed future relocation of Yarmouth CE Primary to All Saints' site and this will affect pupils, staff and future acceptance of school (4).	The proposed relocation of Yarmouth CE Primary School is a decision for their governing body. As clearly set-out in their recent presentations they see the significant benefits that relocation would bring. They also clearly understand the need to reduce the number of schools on the West Wight from five to four in order to ensure future stability.
Freshwater is the right location due to population and local facilities for a 'good' performing school and therefore All Saints' should be retained.	The relocation of Yarmouth CE Primary School if approved would achieve this. It would also ensure the remaining schools are put on a more solid financial footing.
The most recent NHS data shows only a short-term dip in future school-aged population.	As set-out in this report the latest NHS data shows a small increase in the overall number of primary age children across the West Wight. It does not show an increase that would support keeping five schools open going forward.
With a reduction in PAN at All Saints' and proposed future reduction at Brighstone, surplus places already removed (3).	Organisational changes linked to Published Admission Numbers while helpful in the short-term do not provide a longer-term solution to the problem being faced, it would leave five schools with significantly more building capacity than required in the West Wight. All five schools would be faced with financial challenges, as opposed to having four schools with a greater ability to be financially viable going forward.
The proposed future PAN at rebuilt school at Freshwater site is 210, more than current combined Yarmouth & All Saints' number on roll so potentially increasing surplus places and potential knock-on effect on other local schools.	The rebuild school will have a net capacity of 210. The schools PAN will be a decision for governors in discussion with the local authority. A capacity of 210 does ensure future flexibility if required.
West Wight Schools do not have capacity to take All Saints' pupils if it closes in 2020 (2).	If the Federation of Church Schools of Yarmouth and Shalfleet agree to the future relocation of Yarmouth CE Primary School, very careful consideration will be given as to how you best manage the transition phase for those children currently located on the All Saints' site, could they stay on the site during this phase? This decision needs to be taken by educational experts with appropriate advice and support from other professionals. The children would be under the governance and leadership of Yarmouth CE Primary School. Parents can still seek a place at another school on the Island if they choose and if places are available in the year group

	required.
Closing a 'good' school All Saints in 2020, forces pupils to go to a 'Requires Improvement' school at Brighstone.	The council intends that most children will be admitted to schools where places had existed in the classes that support the year group. However, if any year groups are full across all West Wight schools, the Council may ask schools to admit above their preferred maximum class size.
If All Saints' closes in 2020, transport to my nearest school will cost £15 per day.	If the Federation of Church Schools of Yarmouth and Shalfleet agree to the future relocation of Yarmouth CE Primary School, one possible option is for the pupils at All Saints' to remain located on that site, under the governance and leadership of Yarmouth CE Primary should they choose. Where existing All Saints' pupils seek a school place elsewhere the council's Home to School Transport Policy will be applied.
Consultation / Statutory Process followed by Council is flawed / not been followed correctly (5).	The Council has followed the correct statutory process as set-out in the Department for Education 'opening and closing maintained schools' guidance issued in November 2018 regarding the discontinuance of All Saints' CE Primary School. The proposal to relocate Yarmouth CE Primary School and the proposal to close All Saints' CE Primary School are not linked proposals. They would only be linked if the decision maker on both were the same body.
Retain both All Saints' and Yarmouth and rebuild as smaller school (3).	This does not address the over-supply of school accommodation in the West Wight. Small schools are not as financially viable or sustainable as larger schools.
Traffic/drop off at All Saints' school dangerous.	Health and safety will be an integral part of the review and plans for any new or remodelled accommodation at the All Saints' site.
Retain All Saints' as smaller school and give it specialism such as IT.	This does not address the over-supply of school accommodation in the West Wight. Also, small schools are not as financially viable or sustainable as larger schools.